Emissions of nitrous oxide ($N_2O$) occur during the biological denitrification process, but a few studies have focused on $N_2O$ emissions during denitrification under endogenous conditions. To investigate the characteristics of $N_2O$ emissions and accumulation during the process of endogenous denitrification, experiments were carried out to explore the action mechanisms of nitrite ($NO_2^-$) on $N_2O$ production during the denitrification process, with intracellular polymers serving as the electron donor. The results indicated that the $N_2O$ production factors increased with increasing initial $NO_2^-$-N concentration due to the slow biological degradation of the intracellular polymers and the inhibitions of free nitrite acid (FNA) on the activity of nitrous oxide reductase (Nos). When the $NO_2^-$-N concentration was further increased, exceeding 100 mg N/L, the $N_2O$ production factors decreased, potentially on account of the inhibition of increased FNA on the activities of nitrite reductase (Nir) and nitric oxide reductase (Nor), resulting in declined nitrite removal efficiency and increased NO production. Studying the mechanisms of $N_2O$ accumulation during endogenous denitrification is beneficial for controlling $N_2O$ emissions during the biological nitrogen removal process in wastewater treatment.

**Keywords**: nitrous oxide, nitrite, endogenous denitrification, accumulation

---

**Introduction**

Nitrous oxide ($N_2O$) is an important greenhouse gas (GHG) with a global warming effect equal to 298 times that of CO$_2$ in a 100-year perspective [1]. $N_2O$ in the atmosphere can also destroy the ozone layer [2, 3] and produce acid rain and other hazards [4]. A wastewater treatment plant (WWTP) is an important anthropogenic source of $N_2O$ emissions; the range of $N_2O$ emissions from a full-scale WWTP reported in the literature is 0–25% [5]. $N_2O$ generation and accumulation in WWTPs come mainly from the biological nitrogen removal (BNR) process, including the processes of aerobic nitrification and anoxic denitrification [6, 7]. Low DO (dissolved oxygen) levels and high nitrite accumulation in both the nitrification stage and the denitrification stage and insufficient biodegradable substrate (carbon source) in the denitrification stage are
the main factors for \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation and emissions in the BNR process [8].

It is well known that the traditional nitrification and denitrification processes can be achieved through nitrite instead of nitrate in order to achieve nitrogen removal. Compared with nitrate-based nitrification and denitrification technology, approximately 25% of aeration and 40% of carbon source addition can be reduced in this short-cut BNR process, and sludge production can also be reduced to an extent [9, 10]. In addition, on the condition that polyhydroxyalkanoate (PHA), poly-hydroxybutyrate (PHB) and other intracellular polymers are used as electron donors for denitrification, sludge production can be further reduced by approximately 20% compared with that when extracellular organics are used as electron donors [11]. Therefore, the prospect for application of the nitrite-type endogenous denitrification technology is very broad. However, as free nitrite acid (FNA) can inhibit the metabolic behavior of the denitrifying bacteria, once nitrite (NO\(_2^–\)) accumulates in large quantities during endogenous denitrification, \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) will also be produced in this process [12]. Likewise, in the endogenous denitrification process with intracellular polymers (such as PHA, PHB and glycogen) serving as the electron donors for oxynitride reduction, more accumulation and emission of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) would be observed [13, 14]. Therefore, due to the large accumulation of nitrite and the use of intracellular polymers as carbon sources for denitrification, the short-cut BNR process may generate and release large amounts of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) [15, 16]. More attention should be paid to \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) emissions for the short-cut biological nitrogen removal with a high nitrite accumulation [17].

In this paper, \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) production during endogenous denitrification at different initial NO\(_2^–\)-N concentrations was studied by experimental methods, aimed at clarifying the mechanisms of nitrite on \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation in the process of endogenous denitrification. To explore the accumulation mechanism of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) in the BNR process is helpful in mitigation of GHG emissions from WWTPs.

Material and Methods

Experiment Setup

The experiment was carried out on a six-stand agitator. Six identical open beakers (with an effective volume of 500 mL) containing a mixture of activated sludge were placed on the six-strand agitator to conduct the reaction. At the beginning of the reaction, sodium nitrite (NaNO\(_2\)) solution was added to each beaker. The stirring rate of the six-strand agitator was approximately 100±10 r/min, and the reaction temperature was at the room temperature of 23.6-25.4ºC. The reaction device is shown in Fig. 1.

Experiment Design

The activated sludge used in the experiment was taken from an aeration tank in a continuous flow wastewater treatment reactor from our laboratory. The laboratory-scale reactor was operated in the anaerobic-anoxic/aerobic (A\(^2\)/O) mode, with an effective volume of 37.5 L. The influent of the reactor was composed of synthetic wastewater to simulate domestic sewage, and the hydraulic retention time (HRT) and the sludge retention time (SRT) of the system were 15 h and 20 d, respectively [19]. The reactor was operated for more than 6 months and the heterotrophic bacteria were enriched with acetate as the source of organic carbon. The effluent COD, ammonia nitrogen (NH\(_4^+\)-N), nitrite nitrogen (NO\(_2^–\)-N) and nitrate nitrogen concentrations in the aeration tank were 10 mg/L, 1.17-1.61 mg N/L, 0 mg N/L and 0 mg N/L, respectively, and the dissolved

![Fig. 1. Schematic diagram of the reaction devices.](image-url)
endogenous denitrification by heterotrophic bacteria is called endogenous denitrification [7, 17]. Therefore, etc.) as the carbon source for denitrification, which is (intracellular polymers of PHA, PHB and glycogen, microorganisms can also consume their own cellular anoxic respiration with organics as electron donors microorganisms reduce nitrate or nitrite to N\textsubscript{2}O. The initial dissolved oxygen (DO) concentration was approximately 2.2 mg O\textsubscript{2}/L, and the initial pH of the mixture was 6.85. Then the six beakers were placed on the six-strand agitator simultaneously. Before starting the reaction, six solutions of NaNO\textsubscript{2} with different NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N concentrations were added to the beakers, making the initial NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N concentration in six beakers to be 10 mg N/L (1#), 30 mg N/L (2#), 60 mg N/L (3#), 100 mg N/L (4#), 200 mg N/L (5#) and 250 mg N/L (6#), respectively. The nitrite was continuously reduced under anoxic stirring conditions. The variation trends of N\textsubscript{2}O production in each beaker were measured successively with a measurement interval of 30-60 min. The water quality indexes, sludge concentration, DO and pH at the beginning and end of the reaction in the six beakers were analyzed and determined.

Analysis Methods

Experimental monitoring items, which included COD, NH\textsubscript{4}\textsuperscript{+}-N, NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{-}-N, NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N, MLSS and MLVSS, were analyzed according to standard methods [20]; DO, temperature and pH were monitored by online probes. The total nitrogen (TN) concentration was based on the sum of ammonia nitrogen, nitrite nitrogen and nitrate nitrogen. N\textsubscript{2}O produced by the system was comprised of the dissolved N\textsubscript{2}O in the mixture and the N\textsubscript{2}O emitted into the air. The dissolved N\textsubscript{2}O in the mixture was determined using the Unisense Microelectrode System (Arhus, Denmark), and the emission of N\textsubscript{2}O was obtained by the calculation methods described in the literature [21, 22]; N\textsubscript{2}O production was based on the sum of the amounts of the dissolved N\textsubscript{2}O and the emitted N\textsubscript{2}O.

Results and Discussion

Reaction of the Endogenous Denitrification Process

Biological denitrification is a process in which microorganisms reduce nitrate or nitrite to N\textsubscript{2} by anoxic respiration with organics as electron donors and nitrate or nitrite as electron receptors [9]. When the carbon source in the influent is insufficient, microorganisms can also consume their own cellular (intracellular polymers of PHA, PHB and glycogen, etc.) as the carbon source for denitrification, which is called endogenous denitrification [7, 17]. Therefore, endogenous denitrification by heterotrophic bacteria is a process of decreasing microbial cell materials. The microorganisms in this study came from the continuous flow A\textsuperscript{2}/O reactor. The heterotrophic bacteria stored most of the organic substrate in the influent during the anaerobic stage in the original A\textsuperscript{2}/O reactor, followed by use of the formed intracellular polymers for growth and metabolism in the subsequent anoxic and aerobic stage [25]. Since the biodegradation rate of organic matter stored in microbial cells is lower than that of extracellular organic matter [26], the heterotrophic bacteria prioritize the use of extracellular substrate the biodegradable organics in influent) for aerobic and anoxic growth and the use intracellular polymers after the depletion of the biodegradable substrate [7]. Therefore, under certain conditions, the residual intracellular polymers were still present in microorganisms in the aerobic sludge of the A\textsuperscript{2}/O reactor.

The activated sludge containing the residual intracellular polymers was used in the experiment to investigate N\textsubscript{2}O production during the process of endogenous denitrification at different initial NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N concentrations. Intracellular polymers stored in the microbial cells were used as the electron donor to reduce nitrite to NO, N\textsubscript{2}O and N\textsubscript{2} in sequence. The experimental results are shown in Fig. 2. As the results show, because certain DO (2.2 mg O\textsubscript{2}/L, brought from the activated sludge mixture of the aerobic tank) existed at the commencement of the reaction and a small amount of O\textsubscript{2} from the air was brought into and dissolved in the mixture due to the mechanical stirring, nitrite was oxidized to nitrate by autotrophic bacteria in the mixture and, accordingly, the denitrification of nitrate was observed in the experiments (Fig. 2e). As a consequence, at the end of the reaction, as DO was consumed by the growth process of autotrophic bacteria, the DO concentration in the mixture decreased to below 0.15 mg O\textsubscript{2}/L (Fig. 2c). In addition, during nitrite denitrification, as the biological reduction reaction continuously produced alkalinity (OH\textsuperscript{-}), the pH of the mixture at the end of the reaction increased from 6.84 to a range of 6.87-7.15. The higher the initial concentration of NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N, the more OH\textsuperscript{-} was produced by the reaction, with a consequent increase in pH (Fig. 2b).

The denitrification process lasted approximately 300~330 min. At the end of the reaction, the removal rate of NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N was in the range of 12.86~74.80% and gradually decreased with the increase in the initial concentration of NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N (Fig. 2d). The highest removal efficiency of nitrite (at 100 mg N/L) was probably because more nitrite was oxidized to nitrate rather than reduced to NO, N\textsubscript{2}O or N\textsubscript{2}, as the TN removal efficiency continually decreased with the increasing initial concentration of NO\textsubscript{2}\textsuperscript{-}-N (Fig. 2f). This result is mainly due to the ratio of the intracellular carbon to nitrogen decreasing in experiments 1 through 6#.

The insufficient electron donors resulted in the low removal efficiency of nitrite and nitrate. Meanwhile, the removal rate of NO\textsubscript{3}\textsuperscript{-}-N decreased with the increase
in the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N. In cases where the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N was low (1# and 2#), the initial concentration of NO$_3$-N was also low, so it could be completely reduced. As the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N continued to increase, reaching 100 mg N/L (4#), the initial concentration of NO$_3$-N reached 23.10 mg N/L, and the NO$_3$-N removal rate was only 8.32%. As the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N and NO$_3$-N continued to rise (5# and 6#), the removal of NO$_3$-N was not observed (Fig. 2e). The TN removal process was similar to that of NO$_3$-N, with a removal rate of 9.19~56.49% (Fig. 2f). NH$_4^+$-N was scarcely detected during the reaction. Since no extra carbon source was provided in the experiment, the heterotrophic bacteria derived the energy for nitrite reduction from the microorganisms’ growth process on their intracellular polymers, so the decrease in MLVSS was observed in different reactions, as shown in Fig. 2a). Because the intracellular polymers are part of the microorganism itself, when these materials were used as electron donors for denitrification, the microorganism cell material and its own weight were reduced [25, 26]. The decreased rate of MLVSS observed in the experiment was approximately 6.12-13.61% and decreased with the increase in the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N. In general, the reaction rate of the heterotrophic bacteria, including the reduction rate of nitrite and nitrate and the uptake rate of intracellular polymers, declined with the increased initial nitrite concentration. This result was mainly due to the inhibition effect of FNA on the activities of microorganisms and the decreased ratio of the intracellular carbon to nitrogen.

In the biological denitrification process, nitrate is reduced to NO$_2$-, NO, N$_2$O, O$_2$ and N$_2$, successively [27], catalyzed by four different reductases: Nar (nitrate reductase), Nir (nitrite reductase), Nor (NO reductase) and Nos (N$_2$O reductase), respectively [28]. As mentioned above, the final product of the traditional denitrification process is N$_2$, and N$_2$O is the intermediate product [29]. N$_2$O production in the endogenous denitrification of nitrate at different initial NO$_2$-N concentrations was measured in this study, and the results are shown in Fig. 3. The results showed that N$_2$O production increased with the increase in the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N. N$_2$O production was 0.20~24 mg N/L on the condition that the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N was in the range of 10~100 mg N/L (experiments 1#~4#). However, N$_2$O production decreased to 17.76 mg N/L (5#) and 14.84 mg N/L (6#) when the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N exceeded 100 mg N/L (experiments 5# and 6#). In other words, N$_2$O production decreased with the increase in the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N on the condition that the initial concentration of NO$_2$-N exceeded 100 mg N/L (5# and 6#) (Fig. 3b). Studies have found that in cases where the available organics are scarce, the electrons provided for complete denitrification by heterotrophic bacteria will be insufficient, often leading to electron competition between four denitrification enzymes [4, 30]. Therefore, due to the low degradation rate of the intracellular polymer, the degradation process could not provide enough electrons. As a consequence, electron competition exists in denitrification systems with...
Characteristics of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) Accumulation...

Intracellular polymers serving as the electron donor [6, 7]. Under these circumstances, due to the reduction of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) to \( \text{N}_2 \), being the last step of denitrification, Nos had a weaker ability to compete for electrons, making it more difficult for Nos to obtain sufficient electrons to reduce \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) to \( \text{N}_2 \) [2, 6]. In addition, it has been reported that the low level of dissolved oxygen present during denitrification stimulates \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation, as Nos is inhibited by oxygen [8, 30]. Therefore, accumulation of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) was inevitable in this denitrification system with intracellular polymers serving as electron donors and the presence of dissolved oxygen in the mixture [31, 32].

In addition, adverse changes in environmental factors, such as pH, temperature and FNA, will intensify electron competition and eventually lead to the accumulation of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) [30]. Especially in the process of endogenous denitrification by heterotrophic bacteria, the main reason for \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation is the stronger inhibition on Nos activity by FNA than on Nir and Nor [33]. Additionally, some studies have reported that the endogenous denitrification of nitrate did not result in \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation, pointing out that FNA might be the inducing factor for \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation, so nitrite played a significant role in \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) accumulation during denitrification [34, 35]. It can be inferred that the higher the initial concentration of \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \), the higher the concentration of FNA [36], consequently resulting in a stronger inhibition of FNA on Nos activity and leading to higher \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) production factors (the ratio of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) production to TN removal), which was observed in experiments 1#-4#, as shown in Fig.4. Based on calculation of the nitrogen balance, the endogenous denitrification reaction removed all of the TN as \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) without producing NO and \( \text{N}_2 \), on condition that the initial \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \) concentration was 100 mg N/L (4#). During the reaction, the strong inhibition of FNA on Nos activity resulted in all \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) produced by NO reduction accumulating in the reactor; therefore, \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) became the sole end product of the denitrification process. Due to the broad depression of FNA on the activities of denitrifying bacteria, the resultant increased \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \) concentration led to a slowed degradation rate of intracellular polymers, thus further leading to slowed denitrification rates of \( \text{NO}_3\text{-N} \), \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \) and \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \). However, the denitrification rate of \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) was slowed more than others due to its weak electron competition ability [21], which resulted in more \( \text{N}_2\text{O} \) production in the case where initial \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \) concentration gradually increased (experiments 1#-4#). This result is consistent with the research results of Wei et al. [37]. However, when the initial concentration of \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \) exceeded 100 mg N/L, the observed range of suppression by FNA increased in this study, including not only Nos but also Nir and Nor. Consequently, as \( \text{NO}_2\text{-N} \) concentration continued to rise significantly, the FNA inhibitory effect on Nor was enhanced as well, causing NO to accumulate in the reactor. As has been reported, NO is highly reactive and toxic and contributes to ozone depletion and air pollution [38]. In addition, since NO has a mutagenic effect in bacteria, it is toxic to a wide range of organisms [39]. Therefore, NO has an inhibitory effect on many nitrogen-metabolizing microorganisms,
including ammonium-oxidizing bacteria, nitrite-oxidizing bacteria, and denitrifiers [40,41]. Due to the microbial inhibition by NO [42], a large amount of accumulated NO suppressed Nir and Nor, leading to the decrease in the removal rate of nitrite (Fig. 2d) and the production factors for N₂O. Accordingly, the production factors for NO and N₂ increased in experiments 5# and 6# (Fig. 4).

Furthermore, it can be seen that the rules of behavior dictating the relationship of dissolved N₂O concentration with the initial NOₓ-N concentration in the six experimental processes was consistent with total N₂O production (Fig. 3). It should be noted that the phenomenon of dissolved N₂O concentration rising at the commencement of the reaction and then declining at the end of the reaction was observed in different experiments. This phenomenon was mainly a result of N₂O being easily soluble in water (Henry coefficient of 0.024 M/atm [6]), so N₂O generated during the reaction quickly dissolved in the mixture, but at the same time the N₂O dissolved in the mixture quickly escaped into the air due to mechanical stirring. In the first half of the reaction (0~175 min), due to the high content of intracellular polymers and the availability of sufficient electrons, the generation rate of N₂O was higher than the emission rate of N₂O, so more N₂O was dissolved in the mixture, and the concentration continued to increase. After a period of reaction, due to the consumption of intracellular polymers, electron availability decreased, leading to an N₂O production rate that was lower than the emission rate. Consequently, the concentration of dissolved N₂O decreased with time in the latter half of the reaction. This result was a unique phenomenon of N₂O accumulation in the sequential batch biological denitrification reactors [43].

Conclusions

The mechanisms of N₂O generation and accumulation were investigated in the process of endogenous denitrification of nitrite. It was found that, due to the inhibition of FNA on Nos, the yield and production factors of N₂O increased with the increase in the initial concentration of NOₓ-N. On the condition that the initial concentration of NOₓ-N reach 100 mg N/L, the final product of the denitrification process was entirely N₂O, while NO and N₂ were not observed. However, in the case of the initial NOₓ-N concentration being higher than 100 mg N/L, the high concentration of FNA inhibited the Nor activity as well, and NO accumulated in the reactor, while the production factor of N₂O decreased. Studying the relationship between N₂O accumulation and the nitrite concentration during endogenous denitrification is beneficial to mitigating GHG emissions from the BNR process in wastewater treatment.

Acknowledgements

This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (grant No. 51778057) and the Ph.D. program of Xi’an University of Science and Technology (grant No. 2017QDJ062).

Conflict of Interest

The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

References

11. THIRD K.A., NEWLAND M., CORD-RUWISCH R. The effect of dissolved oxygen on PHB accumulation
41. KARTAL B., TAN N.C., VAN DE BIEZEN E., KAMPSCHREUR M.J., VAN LOOSDRECHT M.C., JETTEN M.S. Effect of nitric oxide on anammox bacteria.